

# Minutes Regular Meeting of the St. Johns County PLANNING AND ZONING AGENCY

# Thursday, February 2nd, 20223 at 1:30:00 PM

The regularly scheduled public meeting of the St. Johns County Planning and Zoning Agency was held on Thursday, February 2nd, 2023 at 1:30 p.m. in the County Auditorium at the St. Johns County Administrative Complex located at 500 San Sebastian View, St. Augustine, Florida.

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Gregory Matovina, District 1 Chair

Meagan Perkins, District 4, Vice Chair

Eugene Wilson, District 3

Dr. Richard A. Hilsenbeck, District 3

Jack Peter, District 4 Elvis G. Pierre, District 2 Henry F. Green, District 5

**STAFF PRESENT:** Lex Taylor, Sr. Assistant Attorney; Christine Valliere, Asst. County Attorney; Teresa Bishop, AICP, Planning Division Manager; Michael Roberson, Director, Growth Management; Thomas Stalling, Communications Specialist; Hali Barkley, GIS Technician and Marie Colee Assistant Program Manager.

- Call meeting to order at 1:30 pm
- Pledge of Allegiance
- Reading of the Public Notice statement by Perkins

(0:03:03)

- Motioned by Perkins, and seconded by Pierre, carries 6/0, for approval of meeting minutes for PZA 11/18/2021, 12/2/2021, 12/16/2021, 1/20/2022, 2/3/2022, 2/17/2022 and 1/19/2023.
- Public Comments:

Joe McAnarney (1005 Blackberry Lane) discussed an issue that was recently brought to the Board of County Commissioners. Mr. McAnarney explained his opposition to Industrial Parks and their incompatibility within agricultural and residential zoning districts. Provided an example showing the recent result of the C.H.I.E.F project being denied 5/0, by the Board of County Commissioners. Explained that this vote shows us the Commissioners value people and land use compatibility first and foremost when making decisions.

PZA 02/02/2023

#### AGENCY ITEMS:

District 2

**1. SUPMAJ 2022-05 Smith Borrow Pit.** Request for a Special Use Permit to allow a 16.4- acre Borrow Pit area within Open Rural (OR) zoning, pursuant to Sections 2.03.10 and 6.04.09 of the Land Development Code, and to allow for a residential dwelling unit to be located on the same property, subject to the general provisions on Special Uses per Section 2.03.01.A. This request was heard by the Planning and Zoning Agency at their regularly scheduled public hearing on Thursday, November 15, 2022, and was continued by a vote of 4-1 to permit the applicant an opportunity to provide additional evidence and testimony from surrounding property owners.

Staff: Justin Kelly, Senior Planner

Ex parte communication declared by the Agency.

Dr. Hilsenbeck; Wilson: Drove past the site.

**Presenter: Doug Burnett, St Johns Law Group** (104 Seagrove Main Street, St Augustine) presented the request for a special use permit within open rural zoning.

## Speakers:

**Chuck Labanowski** (1748 N. Cappero Dr, St Augustine 32092) OPPOSED. Road safety a big issue with so many dump trucks coming along "dead man's curve" on Pacetti Road.

**Sam Sorgen** (1730 Bennet Road, St Augustine) OPPOSED. Had not been informed of the potential Burrow Pit. Purchased existing property on Bennet Road because it was quite and a residential, open rural area. Concerned about the compatibility of an industrial site operating in a very residential, rural area. If approved, it will affect their way of life.

Burnett: Presented the rebuttal.

Various discussion occurred with the agency members regarding compatibility.

(0:28:25)

Motioned by Perkins and seconded by Pierre, carries 4/2 (dissent Dr Hilsenbeck: Peter) to approve SUPMAJ 2022-05 Smith Borrow Pit, a Special Use Permit based on 19 conditions (including those added by the applicant) and 8 findings of fact as provided in the Staff Report.

- 1. The Special Use Permit, for a Borrow Pit, is granted to Joseph and Denise Smith, and shall be non-transferable to any other location or entity.
- 2. The Special Use Permit shall commence within one (1) year of the signing of the Final Order. Failure to commence within the prescribed time shall render the Order invalid and all rights granted herein shall become null and void. Commencement shall be defined as issuance of a Development Permit by the St. Johns County Operations Division.
- 3. The Special Use Permit is granted under condition of continual use. A Special Use that, once commenced, remains idle, discontinued or unused for a period of one (1) calendar year shall no longer be valid and all rights granted herein shall become null and void.

- 4. Approval of the Special Use Permit does not release the project from adherence to all relevant requirements of the St. Johns County Land Development Code, Comprehensive Plan, and any other Agency having jurisdiction.
- 5. Applicant agrees that St. Johns County may inspect the site for compliance with the Final Order and all other relevant requirements at any time the Special Use is being exercised.
- 6. This approval of the Special Use Permit may be revoked by the County Administrator or designee, in his/her sole discretion, upon a determination of violation of the conditions set forth herein or a violation of Federal, State, or Local law or regulation. Appeals of decisions by the County Administrator or designee to revoke the Special Use Permit may be appealed to the Board of County Commissioners.
- 7. The application, supporting documents, conditions and limitations offered within the application and at the public hearing by the applicant (or representative) will be incorporated herein and shall become part of the Final Order, except as may be modified by preceding conditions and limitations.
- 8. Development shall be consistent with improvements depicted on the site plan labeled Exhibit B and shall be made part of this Order; any change or addition shall constitute a violation of the Special Use approval unless such change is submitted to and approved by the Planning and Zoning Agency.
- 9. The Special Use Permit shall be valid for five (5) years from the date of approval and signing of the Final Order, subject to the commencement and continual use requirements in conditions 2 and 3 above.
- 10. The borrow pit hauling activities will be limited to Monday through Saturday, from 7 AM to 5 PM.
- 11. The operation will utilize the site for an estimated 200 vehicle trips per day (100 round trips).
- 12. There will be a maximum total of six (6) trucks allowed on site (two (2) semi-trailers, four (4) dump trucks).
- 13. A six (6) foot solid wooden fence or similar type fence is required to be maintained around the perimeter of the borrow pit site.
- 14. Haul routes/trucks are required to avoid roadways where schools are located during school peak hours (7 AM to 9 AM and 2 PM to 4 PM). All haulers will be provided the designated haul routes with alternatives that avoid schools to the possible extent.
- 15. A 100-foot landscaped buffer will be maintained around the outside perimeter of the burrow pit.
- 16. Any dewatering pumps will be electric and no gas or diesel pump will be permitted on site.
- 17. Any dewatering pumps will be electric and no gas or diesel pump will be permitted on site.
- 18. The burrow pit will have a rim ditch system to store water and infiltrate it back into the ground to prevent adjacent ground water drawdown.
- 19. All borrow pit activity and commercial lighting on the site will be prohibited after 5.00pm.

#### FINDINGS:

- 1. The Special Use can be granted without substantial detriment to the public good and will not substantially impair the intent and purpose of the St. Johns County Comprehensive Plan or the Land Development Code.
- 2. The use is compatible with the contiguous and surrounding area and will not impose an excessive burden or have a substantial negative impact on surrounding or adjacent uses or on community facilities or services.
- 3. The use, which is listed as a Special Use in the Open Rural (OR) zoning district, complies with all required regulations and standards of Article II of the Land Development Code.
- 4. The request is in compliance with Section 2.03.00, 2.03.10 and Section 6.04.09 of the Land Development Code.
- 5. The request is not in conflict with Future Land Use Designation of Agriculture Intensive (A-I).
- 6. The requested use, although not generally appropriate or without restriction throughout the zoning district, when controlled as to number, location and relationship to the neighborhood, promotes the public health, safety, welfare, morals, order, comfort, convenience, appearance, prosperity, or the general welfare of the residents of the area.
- 7. The requested use is not in conflict with the development patterns of the area.
- 8. The applicant, at the public hearing, has stated no objections to the proposed conditions.

District 3

**2. SUPMIN 2022-17 Smith Residence.** SUPMIN 2022-17 Smith Residence, request for a Special Use Permit to allow for a Manufactured/Mobile Home as a residence in Residential, Single-Family (RS-3) zoning.

Staff: Brandon Tirado, Planner

No ex parte communication declared by the Agency.

**Presenter:** Brenda Gallo presented his request for a special use permit.

## Speakers:

Brenda Pinckney (1895 Sandgate Circle, St Augustine) SUPPORTS. Wants to welcome the Smiths into the neighborhood. Yet concerned about the cutting down of the trees that were on her property. Would appreciate having them removed. She is building two new homes. One is next door to the Smiths. Would like the Smiths to respect the property at 480 Aiken Street because she is renovating that home and will be using it as a residence. Very happy that Mr. Smith is going to be living on his property and not making it a rental home.

Discussion occurred between the applicant and the Agency with regard to whether or not there was a survey and if he would make good the removed trees on the neighbors' property.

(0:49:08)

Motioned by Perkins and seconded by Pierre, carries 6/0, to approve special use permit in SUPMIN 2022-17 Smith residence special use permit subject to ten (10) conditions and eight (8) findings of fact as listed in the Staff Report.

#### **CONDITIONS:**

- 1. The Special Use Permit is granted to Kevin Smith and will be transferable.
- 2. Development shall be consistent with improvements depicted on the site plan labeled "Exhibit B" and shall be made a part of this Order; any change or addition shall constitute a violation of the Special Use approval unless such change is submitted and approved by the Planning and Zoning Agency.
- 3. Applicant agrees that St. Johns County may inspect the site for compliance with the Final Order and all other relevant requirements at the time the Special Use is being executed.
- 4. This approval of the Special Use Permit may be revoked by the County Administrator or designee, in his/her sole discretion, upon a determination of violation of the conditions set forth herein or a violation of any Federal, State, or Local law or regulation. Appeals of decisions by the County Administrator may be appealed to the Board of County Commissioners.
- 5. The Special Use Permit shall be commenced within one (1) year of the signing of the Order; otherwise all rights granted herein shall be null and void. Commencement will be defined as issuance of a Development Permit by the St. Johns County Operations Division.
- 6. The Special Use Permit is granted under the conditions of continual use. A Special Use that, once commenced, remains idle, discontinued or unused for a continuous period of one (1) calendar year shall no longer be valid and all rights granted herein shall become null and void.
- 7. Approval of the Special Use does not release project from compliance with all relevant requirements of the St Johns County Land Development Code, Comprehensive Land Use Plan, Florida Building Code and any other Agency having jurisdiction.
- 8. All towing gear shall be removed.
- 9. Exterior skirting shall be installed to provide a visual barrier for all underfloor mechanical, electrical, and plumbing installations. Skirting shall extend from the underside of the perimeter of the Structure to the adjacent surrounding grade. Skirting may be constructed of pressure treated wood or natural durable wood such as redwood or cedar, or skirting material manufactured specifically for the purpose of installation on manufactured/mobile homes. Skirting shall be permanently maintained free from broken or missing sections, pieces or cross members. Exceptions to these skirting requirements may be made in areas where an enclosed underfloor is prohibited due to storm surge, or where the lowest portion of the first floor joists, measured vertically, exceeds seven (7) feet from grade throughout the entire underfloor area.
- 10. The application, supporting documents, conditions and limitations offered within the application and at the public hearing by the applicant (or representative) will be incorporated herein and shall become part of the Final Order, except as may be modified by preceding conditions and limitations.

## **FINDINGS**:

1. The Special Use can be granted without substantial detriment to the public good and will not substantially impair the intent and purpose of the St. Johns County Comprehensive Plan or this Code.

- 2. The use is compatible with the contiguous and surrounding area and will not impose an excessive burden or have a substantial negative impact on surrounding or adjacent uses or on community facilities or services.
- 3. The use, which is listed as a Special Use in Residential, Single-Family (RS-3) zoning designation complies with all required regulations and standards of Article II of the Land Development Code.
- 4. The request is in compliance with Section 2.03.01 and Section 2.03.08 and Article XII of the Land Development Code.
- 5. The request is not in conflict with the Future Land Use Map Designation of Residential D (RESD).
- 6. The requested Use, although not generally appropriate or without restriction throughout the zoning district, when controlled as to the number, location and relationship, to the neighborhood, promotes the public health, safety, welfare, morals, order, comfort, convenience, appearance, prosperity, or the general welfare of the residents of the area.
- 7. The requested Use is not in conflict with the development patterns of the area.
- 8. The applicant, at the public hearing, has stated no objections to the proposed conditions.

**3. SUPMAJ 2022-14 Fuzion 904 Eatery.** Request for a Special Use Permit to allow on-site sales and consumption of alcoholic beverages under the regulation of the State of Florida Type 4COP license pursuant to Section 2.03.02 of the Land Development Code, located specifically at 6975 A1A South. **Staff: Sloane Stephens, Planner** 

No ex parte communication declared by the Agency

**Presenter: Richard Scott Campion** (6975 A1A South, Crescent Beach, St Augustine) presented the request for a Special Use Permit to allow on-site sales and consumption of alcoholic beverages.

(0:53:48)

Motioned by Peter, seconded by Dr. Hilsenbeck, carries 6/0, to approve special use SUPMAJ 2022-14, Fusion 904 Eatery, request for a special use permit to allow for the on-site sale and consumption of alcoholic beverages located at 6975 A1A South, subject to eleven (11) conditions and eight (8) findings of fact as provided in the Staff Report.

- 1. The Special Use Permit is granted to the proposed Fuzion 904 Eatery, 6975 A1A S, labeled as Exhibit A, and shall be non-transferable to any other location or entity.
- 2. Approval is for the Use as regulated by the State of Florida Type 4COP beverage license, specifically for on-premise consumption.
- 3. Sales area shall be limited to the area designated for such on the Floor Plan labeled as **Exhibit B** submitted by the applicant and made a part of this application.

- **4.** The intended hours of operation are Tuesday-Sunday (closed Monday), 3pm-9pm, eventually extending hours to lunch service once more staff is employed.
- 5. Special Use Permit shall be governed by the St. Johns County Alcohol Beverage Ordinance (Ord. #90-48) as may be amended.
- 6. Special Use Permit shall be governed by the St. Johns County Sale or Service to persons under Twenty-One Ordinance (Ord. #2011-46) as may be amended.
- 7. Applicant agrees that St. Johns County may inspect the site for compliance with the Final Order and all other relevant requirements at the time the Special Use is being exercised.
- 8. This approval of the Special Use Permit may be revoked by the County Administrator or designee, in his/her sole discretion, upon a determination of violation of the conditions set forth herein or a violation of any Federal, State or Local law or regulation. Appeals of decisions by the County Administrator or designee to revoke the Special Use Permit may be appealed to the Board of County Commissioners.
- 9. The Special Use Permit is granted under the conditions of continual use. A Special Use Permit that, once commenced, remains idle, discontinued or unused for a continuous period of one (1) calendar year shall no longer be valid and all rights granted herein shall become null and void.
- 10. Approval of the Special Use Permit does not release project from compliance with all relevant requirements of the St. Johns County Land Development Code, Comprehensive Land Use Plan, Florida Building Code or any other Agency having jurisdiction.
- 11. The application, supporting documents, conditions and limitations offered within the application and at the public hearing by the applicant (or representative) will be incorporated here in and shall become part of the Final Order, except as may be modified by preceding conditions and limitations.

## FINDINGS:

- 1. The Special Use can be granted without substantial detriment to the public good and will not substantially impair the intent and purpose of the St. Johns County Comprehensive Plan or Land Development Code.
- 2. The Use is compatible with the contiguous and surrounding area and will not impose an excessive burden or have a substantial negative impact on surrounding or adjacent uses or on community facilities or services.
- 3. The use, which is listed as a Special Use in the proposed Commercial General (CG) zoning designation and complies with all required regulations and standards of Article II of the Land Development Code.
- 4. The request is in compliance with Sections 2.03.01.A, 2.03.02 and Article XII of the Land Development Code.
- 5. The request is not in conflict with the Future Land Use Designation of Commercial.
- 6. The requested Use, although not generally appropriate or without restriction throughout the zoning district, when controlled as to the number, location and relationship, to the neighborhood, promotes the public health, safety, welfare, morals, order, comfort, convenience, appearance, prosperity, or the general welfare of the residents of the area.

- 7. The requested Use is not in conflict with the development patterns of the area.
- 8. The applicant, at the public hearing, has stated no objections to the proposed conditions.

**4. ZVAR 2022-20 Holladay Renovation.** ZVAR 2022-20 Holladay Renovation, request for a Zoning **Variance** to Table 6.01 of the Land Development Code to allow a six (6) foot nine (9) inch Side Yard setback in lieu of the required 8-foot setback in Residential, Single Family (RS-3) zoning. 2571 South Ponte Vedra Blvd.

Staff: Lauren Dwyer, Planner

**Matovina:** Asked if there was anybody at the meeting to represent the applicant for Item 4. Seeing none, announced there was an email request to the Planning Department to withdraw the application of ZVAR 2022-20 Holladay Renovation. The request stated "Mr. Holladay withheld payment for services, and we are not ready to move forward with a hearing at this time."

**Staff (Teresa Bishop):** Confirmed that it was Blue Wave Builders that wrote the email and that they had made the application.

No ex parte communication declared by the Agency.

(0:55:45)

Motioned by Perkins, seconded by Pierre, carries 6/0, to withdraw ZVAR 2022-20 Holladay Renovation request for a Zoning Variance.

District 1

**5. NZVAR 2022-16 TD Bank Wall Signs.** Request for a Non-Zoning Variance to the Durbin Creek Crossing PUD (Ordinance 2019-66) to allow for an additional nine and a half (9.5) square feet of Advertising Display Area (ADA) for one (1) wall sign.

Staff: Evan Walsnovich, Planner

No ex parte communications declared by the Agency.

**Presenter: Joe Weir,** Anchor Signs (1020 Luker Street, Fort Myers, Florida) presented the request to allow for a larger sign for TD Bank that is in keeping in size and exposure with the surrounding retailers.

(0:58:57)

Motioned by Perkins, seconded by Wilson, carries 6/0, to approve NZVAR 2022-16 TD Bank Wall Signs subject to eight (8) findings of fact and five (5) conditions as listed in the Staff Reports.

## FINDINGS:

- 1. The request for the Non-Zoning Variance has been fully considered after public hearing with legal notice duly published as required by law.
- 2. There are practical difficulties in carrying out the strict letter of the regulation.

- 3. The Non-Zoning Variance request is not based exclusively upon a desire to reduce the cost of developing the site.
- 4. The proposed Non-Zoning Variance will not substantially increase congestion on surrounding public streets, the danger of fire, or other hazard to the public.
- 5. The proposed Non-Zoning Variance will not substantially diminish property values in, nor alter the essential character of, the area surrounding the site.
- 6. The effect of the proposed Non-Zoning Variance is in harmony with the general intent of this Code and the specific intent of the relevant subject area(s) of the Code.
- 7. The Copy, Face, or Message is not effectively viewable from the nearest road or street right-of-way.
- 8. The applicant, at the public hearing, has stated no objections to the proposed conditions.

## **CONDITIONS:**

- 1. The Non-Zoning Variance will be non-transferable and will not run with the title to the property. The relief applies only to TD Bank as presented.
- 2. Approval of the Non-Zoning Variance does not release the project from compliance with all relevant requirements of the St. Johns County Land Development Code, Comprehensive Land Use Plan, or any other Agency having jurisdiction.
- 3. The Non-Zoning Variance shall commence within one (1) year of the signing of the Final Order. Failure to commence within the prescribed time shall render the Order invalid and all rights granted herein shall become null and void. Commencement shall be defined as issuance of a Development Permit by the St. Johns County Development Review Division.
- 4. The application, supporting documents, conditions and limitations offered within the application and at the public hearing by the applicant (or representative) will be incorporated herein and shall become part of the Final Order, except as may be modified by preceding conditions and limitations.
- 5. The Non-Zoning Variance is limited to the requested relief from the specific provisions of the Land Development Code. Approval of this request shall not operate as approval or waiver of any other provision of the Land Development Code or Comprehensive Plan. Representations and depictions within the application materials shall assist Staff in the interpretation of the requested relief but shall not operate as approval of, or as a determination of compliance with, any other provision of the Land Development Code or Comprehensive Plan.

District 5

**6. MINMOD 2022-20 Fifth Third Bank (New Twin Creeks).** Request for a Minor Modification to the New Twin Creeks PUD (Ordinance 2015-52, as amended) to add Financial Institutions with Drive Through Facilities as a permitted commercial use on Parcel 6A-2.

Staff: Justin Kelly, Senior Planner

No ex parte communication declared by the Agency.

Presenter: Tony Robbins, AICP | Prosser, Inc. presented the request on behalf of Fourth Avenue.

(1:02:14)

Motioned by Perkins, seconded by Peter, carries 6/0, to approve request for a minor modification to the MINMOD 2022-20 Fifth Third Bank (New Twin Creeks) PUD. Subject to seven (7) conditions and seven (7) findings of fact as listed in the Staff Report.

#### FINDINGS:

- 1. The request for this Minor Modification has been fully considered after public hearing with legal notice duly published as required by law.
- 2. The Minor Modification complies with the Land Development Code, Section 5.03.05, which provides criteria for Minor Modifications.
- 3. The proposed Minor Modification is not contrary to the public interest and is not in conflict with the surrounding development.
- 4. The request is consistent with applicable portions of the St. Johns County Comprehensive Plan.
- 5. The request complies with Part 2.03.46 of the Land Development Code regarding Financial Institutions with or without Drive Through facilities.
- 6. The request is not in conflict with the Residential-C Future Land Use Map designation.
- 7. The applicant, at the public hearing, has stated no objections to the proposed conditions.

- 1. Approval of the Minor Modification will be non-transferable and will apply only to the proposed use as described in the attached Master Development Plan Text labeled "Exhibit B".
- 2. Approval of the Minor Modification does not release the project from compliance with all relevant requirements of the St. Johns County Land Development Code, Comprehensive Land Use Plan and any other Agency having jurisdiction.
- 3. The Minor Modification shall commence within one (1) year of the signing of the Resolution. Failure to commence within the prescribed time shall render the Resolution invalid and all rights granted herein shall become null and void. Commencement shall be defined as issuance of a Development Permit by the St. Johns County Operations Division.
- 4. The Master Development Plan Text labeled "Exhibit B" shall be made a condition of approval. Any change or variation shall constitute a violation of the Minor Modification approval in accordance with LDC, Section 5.03.05.
- 5. The approval requested within this application is limited to the requested relief from the specific provisions of the Land Development Code. Approval of this request shall not operate as approval or waiver of any other provision of the Land Development Code or Comprehensive Plan. Representations and depictions within application materials shall assist Staff in the recommendation and interpretation of the requested relief but shall not operate as approval of, or as a determination of compliance with any other provision of the Land Development Code or Comprehensive Plan.
- 6. The application, supporting documents, conditions and limitations offered within the application and at the public hearing by the applicant (or representative) will be incorporated herein and shall become part of the Resolution, except as may be modified by preceding conditions and limitations.
- 7. The applicant at the public hearing has stated no objections to the proposed conditions.

**7. MINMOD 2022-21 Stillwater (Greenbriar Downs) 11CG License.** Request for a Minor Modification to the Greenbriar Downs PUD (ORD. 2019-15, as amended) to allow for the sale of alcoholic beverages and the use of food trucks for facilities related to the community/amenity center.

Staff: Evan Walsnovich, Planner

No ex parte communication declared by the Agency.

Presenter: Karen Taylor (77 Gossa Street) presented the request to the Agency.

(1:16:16)

Motioned by Peter and seconded by Perkins, carries 6/0, to approve MINMOD 2022-21 Stillwater (Greenbriar Downs) 11CG License based on seven (7) findings of fact and seven (7) conditions as provided within the Staff Report.

## FINDINGS:

- 1. The request for this Minor Modification has been fully considered after public hearing with legal notice duly published as required by law.
- 2. The Minor Modification complies with the Land Development Code, Section 5.03.05, which provides criteria for Minor Modifications.
- 3. The proposed Minor Modification is not contrary to the public interest and is not in conflict with the surrounding development.
- 4. The request is consistent with applicable portions of the St. Johns County Comprehensive Plan.
- 5. The request complies with Part 2.03.02 and Article XII of the Land Development Code.
- 6. The request is not in conflict with the Residential-B Future Land Use Map designation.
- 7. The applicant, at the public hearing, has stated no objections to the proposed conditions.

- 1. Approval of the Minor Modification will be non-transferable and will apply only to the proposed use as described in the attached Master Development Plan Text labeled "Exhibit B".
- 2. Approval of the Minor Modification does not release the project from compliance with all relevant requirements of the St. Johns County Land Development Code, Comprehensive Land Use Plan and any other Agency having jurisdiction.
- 3. The Minor Modification shall commence within one (1) year of the signing of the Resolution. Failure to commence within the prescribed time shall render the Resolution invalid and all rights granted herein shall become null and void. Commencement shall be defined as issuance of a Development Permit by the St. Johns County Operations Division.
- 4. The Master Development Plan Text labeled "Exhibit B" shall be made a condition of approval. Any change or variation shall constitute a violation of the Minor Modification approval in accordance with LDC, Section 5.03.05.
- 5. The approval requested within this application is limited to the requested relief from the specific provisions of the Land Development Code. Approval of this request shall not operate as approval or waiver of any other provision of the Land Development Code or Comprehensive Plan. Representations and depictions within application materials shall assist Staff in the recommendation and interpretation of the requested relief but shall not operate as approval

- of, or as a determination of compliance with any other provision of the Land Development Code or Comprehensive Plan.
- 6. The application, supporting documents, conditions and limitations offered within the application and at the public hearing by the applicant (or representative) will be incorporated herein and shall become part of the Resolution, except as may be modified by preceding conditions and limitations.
- 7. The applicant at the public hearing has stated no objections to the proposed conditions.

**8. MINMOD 2022-24 Fire Station 11 & SO SW Command Center.** Request for a Minor Modification to the Cypress Lakes PUD (ORD 1986-15, as amended) to allow Public Service as an allowable use specifically on property located at 4401 Cypress Links Blvd.

Staff: Saleena Randolph, Planner

No ex parte communication declared by the Agency.

**Presenter: Autumn Martinage,** Senior Planner, Matthews Design Group, presented the request for a minor modification to Fire Station 11 & SO SW Command Center.

(1:20:07)

Motioned by Perkins and seconded by Dr. Hilsenbeck, carries 6/0, to approve MINMOD 2022-24 Fire Station 11 & SO SW Command Center based on six (6) findings of fact and seven (7) conditions as provided in the Staff Report.

#### FINDINGS:

- 1. The request for this Minor Modification has been fully considered after public hearing with legal notice duly published as required by law.
- 2. The proposed Minor Modification is in compliance with Land Development Code Section 5.03.05 which provides criteria for Minor Modifications to PUDs.
- 3. The proposed Minor Modification is not contrary to the public interest and is not in conflict with the surrounding development.
- 4. The request is consistent with applicable portions of the St. Johns County Comprehensive Plan.
- 5. The request is not in conflict with the Future Land Use designation of Residential-B.
- 6. The applicant, at the public hearing, has stated no objections to the proposed conditions.

- 1. Approval of the Minor Modification shall be transferable and will run with the title of the property.
- 2. The approval of the Minor Modification does not release the project from compliance with all relevant requirements of the St. Johns County Land Development Code, Comprehensive Land Use Plan, and any other Agency having jurisdiction.
- 3. The Minor Modification shall commence within one (1) year of the signing of the Resolution. Failure to commence within the prescribed time shall render the Resolution invalid and all rights granted herein shall become null and void. Commencement shall be defined as issuance of a Development Permit by the St. Johns County Operations Division.

- 4. The Master Development Plan Map, labeled **Exhibit B**, shall be made a condition of approval. Any change or variation shall constitute a violation of the Minor Modification approval in accordance with LDC Section 5.03.05.
- 5. The approval requested within this application is limited to the requested relief from the specific provisions of the Land Development Code. Approval of this request shall not operate as approval or waiver of any other provision of the Land Development Code or Comprehensive Plan. Representations and depictions within the application materials shall assist Staff in the interpretation of the requested relief but shall not operate as approval of, or as a determination of, compliance with any other provision of the Land Development Code or Comprehensive Plan.
- 6. The application, supporting documents, conditions and limitations offered within the application and at the public hearing by the applicant (or representative) will be incorporated herein and shall become part of the Resolution, except as may be modified by preceding conditions and limitations.
- 7. Sirens will only be used at State Road 207 unless serving the Cypress Lakes community.

**9. DRI MOD 2022-01 RiverTown.** Request to modify the RiverTown Development of Regional Impact (DRI) to revise the school mitigation requirements, address the abandonment of the Eagle nest, which include changes to Map H (DRI Master Plan), the proposed Greenway Map and the Wildlife/Plant Resources Map, add a date certain for the provision of a library site and a fire station site, clarify the residential development rights include age restricted units, and reduce the proposed roundabout locations on SR 13. A PUD Major Modification accompanies this DRI Modification request. RiverTown is located along SR 13 North, south of Greenbriar Road, with Longleaf Pine Parkway being located to the east.

Staff: Teresa Bishop, AICP, Planning Division Manager

Ex parte communication declared by the Agency.

**Wilson; Dr Hilsenbeck; Perkins:** Received a call from Ms. Smith. Did not have a chance to return the call.

Peter, Pierre: Received a call from Ms. Smith and discussed the project.

**Matovina:** Had two phone conversations with Ms. Smith. One on Tuesday and another on Wednesday, as had further questions with relation to the dedications and size of the parcels.

## (1:21:47)

**Presenter: Ellen Avery-Smith, Esq.,** Rogers-Towers, Attorneys at Law presented the requests listed in Items 9 and 10, for the DRI MOD 2022-01 River Town and the MAJMOD 2022-09 River Town, as a joint application.

Ms. Smith explained the proposed changes to the DRI order. In particular with regard to the proposed schools, Eagle Nest Site abandonment, changes to the Library and Fire Station sites, clarifying that 770 residential units (Watersong) are age restricted, and the changes in Residential Development Rights for Active Adults, and adding an additional multi- family lot type for workforce housing.

Further discussion occurred between the Agency and Ms. Smith with regard to the progress and development of the proposed schools.

**Applicant: Ryan Stillwell** (13901 Sutton Park Drive) with Prosper Civil Engineering, explained the progress on the three roundabouts, which was originally planned to be five. Now will ultimately be three as listed in the DOT.

(1:55:20)

Motioned by Perkins and seconded by Peter, carries 6/0, to recommend approval of DRIMOD 2022, River Town based on five (5) findings of fact as listed in the Staff Report.

## FINDINGS:

- 1. This request was fully considered after public hearing with legal notice duly published as required by law.
- 2. The requested changes meet the provisions of Section 380.06(7) of the Florida Statutes.
- 3. The changes requested in the DRI MOD are consistent with the Land Development Code of St. Johns County, as amended.
- 4. The changes requested in the DRI MOD are compatible with the surrounding area and the future development trends of the area.
- 5. The changes requested in the DRI MOD are consistent with and further the objectives of the 2025 St. Johns County Comprehensive Plan.

District 1

10. MAJMOD 2022-09 RiverTown. Request to modify the RiverTown Planned Unit Development (PUD) for consistency with the DRI Modification, which include: revise the school mitigation requirements, remove the abandoned Eagle nest protection measures from the MDP Text and Map, clarify the residential entitlements include age restricted units, and revise proposed roundabout locations on SR 13. A DRI Modification accompanies this PUD Major Modification. RiverTown is located along SR 13 North, south of Greenbriar Road, with Longleaf Pine Parkway being located to the east.

**Presenter: Ellen Avery-Smith, Esq.,** Rogers Towers, Attorneys at Law presented this application jointly with Item 9.

(1:55:50)

Motioned by Perkins and seconded by Peter, carries 6/0, to recommend approval of MAJMOD 2022-09 River Town based on six (6) findings of fact as listed in the Staff Report.

## FINDINGS:

- 1. The request for a Major Modification has been fully considered after public hearing pursuant to the legal notice as required by Florida law and the St. Johns County Land Development Code.
- 2. The request is consistent with the goals, objectives and policies of the 2025 St. Johns County Comprehensive Plan.
- **3.** The request is consistent with Part 5.03.05.C of the St. Johns County Land Development Code, which provides conditions for Major Modifications to approved PUDs.

- 4. The request is consistent with Part 4.03.00 of the St. Johns County Land Development Code, which provides standards for Planned Unit Developments and with the General Standards of Section 5.03.02 with respect to (B) location, (C) minimum size, (D) compatibility, and (E) adequacy of facilities.
- **5.** The modification to the Master Development Plan Map and Text meets all requirements of Section 5.03.02.G of the St. Johns County Land Development Code.
- **6.** The request is consistent with Policy A.1.3.11 of the 2025 St. Johns County Comprehensive Plan in that it does not adversely affect the orderly development of St. Johns County and is compatible with the development trends of the surrounding area.

Recess of 9 minutes.
Reconvene at 3:35pm

11. Discussion Item - Workforce Housing Zoning District. NEFBA requested to present desired changes to Workforce Housing Zoning District regulations at PZA on 2/2/23, which is attached. On 10/18/22 the Board directed Growth Management staff to amend the Workforce Housing Maximum Initial Sales Price to \$260,000 and the minimum percentage of workforce housing units to 30%. Such action requires amendments to both the Land Development Code and Comprehensive Plan. The LDC amendment was heard by the PZA on 12/1/22 and received a recommendation to approve with a vote of 4-2; it is scheduled for consideration/first reading at BCC on 2/21/23. The companion CP amendment is being presented to the PZA on 2/2/23 for transmittal.

Staff: Amy Ring, Special Projects Manager

(1:56:40)

**Presenter: Austin Nicklas,** Director of Government Affairs Northeast Florida Builders Association (NEFBA) presented information on this discussion item. Presented a comparison of the price of workforce housing and the percentages required in other Florida Counties similar to St Johns. Presented a compelling case for the need of more work force housing in St Johns County.

**Presenter: Bob Porter,** NEFBA, (4220 Race Track Road, St Johns 32259) explained the need for the increase to \$260,000 as a sales price for workforce housing and the reduction of the number of units to 30%. Explained the recent years increased cost of building supplies and the cost of transportation of these supplies. Explained that free enterprise, like D.R. Horton, is trying to address this issue of a lack of affordable work force housing in St Johns County. That there is no request from the NEFBA for a reduction in County fees.

Discussion occurred between the Agency and the presenters with regard to the number of new homes being built under the workforce housing zoning district regulations.

**Staff (Mike Roberson)**: Confirmed that there had been 397 workforce homes approved in St Johns County, as at October 2022.

(2.11.15)

Speakers:

**Beth Breeding** (10175 Fortune Pkwy, Jacksonville 32256) SUPPORT. Explained that the \$260,000 price point and 30% as workforce housing was needed to be approved. That very few developers can undertake this type of housing development due to rising building costs. Currently planning a development that will bring 300 units as workforce housing if this is approved.

**Tom Ingraham** (233 East Bay Street, Jacksonville.) SUPPORT. Explained this is part of a portfolio of efforts being undertaken by the County to address the need for affordable housing. Suggest the County should be considering, in the future, waiving their impact fees all together for affordable housing.

Beth Tate (441 E Kesley Lane, St Johns 32259) SUPPORT. Spoke on behalf of St Johns Chamber of Commerce, Public Policy Committee. Also Chairs Worker Housing Coalition. Presented a document that that was approved by the entire Board of Directors on the St Johns Board of Directors. Explained St Johns County is experiencing an affordable housing crisis across the entire income spectrum. What the chamber is focusing on is the limited income band from \$45,000 to \$60,000. This is our core workers across the workforce from first responders, law enforcement, medical professionals, manufacturing, technology employees and our educators. These professions are the back bone of our County. Without housing for these people the County will not be able to continue to grow and thrive in coming years.

Presented an over head of the needs, of three of the major employers (Northrop Grumman, Sheriffs' Office and Flagler Health) in St Johns County, for affordable housing for their workforce. The deficit of what is needed, from these employers, is almost 1500 units.

Many workers cannot afford to buy a home due to the current rising prices. Hence, the need to expand and provide more rental homes. Adding a duplex home would also be very beneficial to these workers and their families. Agree with adding density in certain land use categories.

Supports the need to increase the affordable housing price point to \$260,000 and reduce the number of units to 30% so St Johns County can get these housing units built by free enterprise.

**Staff(Amy Ring)**; Confirmed item 11 was advertised as a discussion item only.

**Staff (Christine Valliere):** Explained to the Agency that item 11 was just a presentation item for the PZA board to consider. It is not before the board as an ordinance. Hence did not require a voting motion. The ordinance that was directed by the Board of County Commissioners will have two readings where NEBFA will make a presentation at the first reading where the Board direct additional changes they would like to see as part of that.

**Matovina**: So we don't need an official registered vote. Yet it would be important for the Board to hear from the PZA on this.

**Wilson:** Signed first contract to teach for under \$29,000. So think what they are doing is best for St John's County.

**Dr. Hilsenbeck:** Would like the PZA to make a recommendation to the Board of County Commissioners to approve this.

Perkins; Peter; Pierre: All agreed with the recommendation.

**Staff (Christine Valliere):** Advised the Board they could add their approval for the recommendations from NEFBA to the voting on item 12, that is Amendment to the Comprehensive Plan, Land Use Element A.1.11.1(m).

(2:23:43)

12. Amendment to the Comprehensive Plan, Land Use Element A.1.11.1(m), reducing the percentage of minimum required dedicated workforce housing units from 40 percent to 30 percent. On October 18, 2022, the Board directed Growth Management staff to amend Land Development Code Article V, Section 5.11.00 Workforce Housing Zoning Designation, reducing to 30% the minimum percentage of required dedicated workforce housing units. Such motion requires a companion change to the Comprehensive Plan Land Use element, A.1.11.1(m), to amend specific references to the minimum percentage requirement.

**Presenter - Amy Ring, Special Projects Manager presented the request.** 

The Agency raised a further question that was addressed by the Staff.

(2:26:05)

Motioned by Perkins, seconded by Peter, carries 6/0, recommend approval of transmittal Comprehensive Plan Amendment 2022-07 to revise Policy A.1.11.1 (m) on the Workforce Housing Division subject to three (3) findings of fact listed in the Staff Report and the recommendation of the changes presented by NEFBA at today's hearing.

# **FINDINGS:**

- 1. The proposed Comprehensive Plan Amendment was fully considered after public hearing pursuant to legal notice duly published as required by law.
- 2. The proposed Comprehensive Plan Amendment is consistent with the St. Johns County Comprehensive Plan, Ordinance No. 2010-38, as amended, the Northeast Florida Strategic Regional Policy Plan, the Community Planning Act and Land Development Regulation Act (Chapter 163, Florida Statutes), subject to further assessment at the adoption hearing.
- **3.** The proposed Comprehensive Plan Amendment is procedurally consistent with Part 5.11.00 of the St. Johns County Land Development Code, subject to further assessment at the adoption hearing.

**Staff Reports:** (Mike Roberson) advised that while the minutes are a little behind, the staff are working to catch up on the minutes in the coming meetings.

Agency Reports: Mr. Peter advised he will not be attending the next meeting.

Minutes approved on the Aday of March, 2023.

Greg Matovina, Chair
Planning and Zoning Agency

Marie Colee, Assistant Program Manager

Growth Management