
RE: Review of Cultural Resource Management Plan for Magic Beach Motel

From Lucas, Kyra <Kyra.Lucas@dos.fl.gov>

Date Thu 6/26/2025 1:20 PM

To Megan Wright <mwright@sjcfl.us>

Cc Ryan Mauch <rmauch@sjcfl.us>; Michael Lagasse <mlagasse@sjcfl.us>; Kealey West <kwest@sjcfl.us>

Hello Megan,

Thank you for reaching out to the Florida Division of Historical Resources. It is very painful to see such a beloved, beautiful, and historically and architecturally significant motel up for demolition. Ultimately though, most regulations, National or local, afford private properties owners the right to do with their properties as they please. It seems like the CRM plan for mitigation does quite a bit of the same things that we would ask for if this was going through a compliance review and the suggestions for HABS drawings, reuse of character defining ornamentation, and the memorial space proposed are appropriate. I would encourage you to also ask for a write up of the local and social history of the motel, especially as it relates to the community, if that has not already been done as well as an extensive interior and exterior photo package. It also appears that you have the authority to put a 90 day demo hold on the property in order to find someone to document, buy (maybe main street), or relocate the building, assuming the owner is open to selling or relocating. I would encourage you and the board to have a conversation with the owners and relevant participants about alternatives to demolition, such as abandoning the first floor as a pass through flood zone and building up instead. I do not know the structural stability of the resource so I cannot state whether or not that is viable, but it is a conversation. Finally, you could recommend to the board that they stipulate a condition of demolition approval be that the design review board and the CRRB retain design review purview over the redevelopment project. I do not know if that is enforceable within your ordinance, so please double check with your county manager and/or attorney, but I have seen that used in other areas.

Best of luck,

Dr. Kyra Lucas

Supervisor | Survey, Registration, Architectural and Technical Services | Bureau of Historic Preservation | Florida Department of State | 500 South Bronough Street | Tallahassee, Florida 32399 | Office 850.245.6339 | Cell 850.766.1352 | Kyra.Lucas@dos.fl.gov | [Dos.fl.gov/historical/](https://dos.fl.gov/historical/)

From: Megan Wright <mwright@sjcfl.us>

Sent: Wednesday, June 25, 2025 1:42 PM

To: Lucas, Kyra <Kyra.Lucas@dos.fl.gov>

Cc: Ryan Mauch <rmauch@sjcfl.us>; Michael Lagasse <mlagasse@sjcfl.us>; Kealey West <kwest@sjcfl.us>

Subject: Review of Cultural Resource Management Plan for Magic Beach Motel

EMAIL RECEIVED FROM EXTERNAL SOURCE

The attachments/links in this message have been scanned by Proofpoint.

Good afternoon Dr. Lucas,

As a CLG representative in St Johns County, I would like to request a SHPO review of the Cultural Resource Management Plan (CRMP) submitted for mitigation of an adverse effect to a Significant Cultural Resource for Magic Beach Motel located at 50 Vilano Road, Saint Augustine, FL 32084. **This is a time-sensitive matter and I would appreciate receipt of this review no later than end of business day Friday, June 27th. I apologize for the short notice.** I have attached a 2021 Significant Cultural Resource designation resolution created by the CRRB, Florida Master Site File Excerpts and the CRMP. Please let me know if there are any other materials required for a review of the CRMP.

Below is a section of St. Johns County Land Development Code, Section 03.01.04:

"E. Review of Projects affecting Significant Cultural Resources

1. In reviewing projects affecting Significant Cultural Resources, the County Administrator shall make a determination of "No Adverse Effect" or "Adverse Effect" to the resource.

a. A Project is considered to have an effect when the characteristics of the Cultural Resource that qualified the resource as significant are proposed to be altered. Alteration of features in the surrounding environs may also have an effect.

b. A Project is considered to have an Adverse Effect when the effect may reasonably be foreseen to diminish or degrade the integrity of the location, design, setting, materials or workmanship of the historic property or the general integrity of an archaeological site. Adverse effects on historic properties include, but are not limited to:

(1) Physical destruction, damage, or alteration of significant elements of all or part of the property or Archaeological Site.

(2) Isolation of the property from its setting, or alteration of the character of the property's setting, when that setting contributes to the property's qualification as a Significant Cultural Resource.

(3) Introduction of visual, audible, or atmospheric elements that are out of character with the property or adversely alter its setting.

2. If the County Administrator makes a determination of "No Adverse Effect", then the project may proceed without alteration. This determination may be reconsidered if substantive changes in project design or if new information is made known.

3. If the County Administrator makes a determination that the proposed Development will have an "Adverse Effect", the applicant must submit a Cultural Resource Management Plan to be reviewed and approved by the County Administrator. The Plan should be developed with input from the County Administrator, and shall establish alternatives to avoid, minimize, or mitigate the effect. The County Administrator reserves the right to request a concurrent review by the CRRB and the State Historic Preservation Office to aid in assessing the plan for approval. The Plan may also be subject to approval by the CRRB and the State Historic Preservation Office."

Thank you very much for your diligence and attention,



Megan Wright

Environmental Specialist

Growth Management Department

St. Johns County Board of County Commissioners

4040 Lewis Speedway, St. Augustine FL 32084

904-209-0623 | www.sjcfi.us

